

EXHIBIT C: MEETING MINUTES

MEETING MINUTES
INDUSTRIAL BUSINESS ZONE (IBZ) BOUNDARY COMMISSION
JUNE 28, 2012, 2:30PM
110 WILLIAM STREET, 4TH FLOOR, ROOM 4A/B

IBZ Boundary Commission Board Members:

Present: Donald Giampietro (SBS Proxy), Theresa Ward (DCAS Proxy), Melva Miller (Queens Borough President's Office Proxy), Richard Bearak (Brooklyn Borough President's Office Proxy), Even Baron (Pratt Center), Shira Gans (Manhattan Borough President's Office Proxy), Barry Dinerstein (DCP Proxy), Bea de la Torre (HPD Proxy), Wilhelm Ronda (Bronx Borough President's Office Proxy), Thomas Farielio (DOB Proxy), Seth Pinsky (NYCEDC)

Absent: Staten Island Borough President's Office

Quorum Present? Yes

Staff to the Boundary Commission:

Present: Miquela Craytor, Asima Jansveld

Absent: None

Others:

Tara Raghuveer (City Hall), Jodi Byron (DCP), Nnenna Lynch (City Hall), Tom McKnight (NYCEDC), Kelvin Collins (SBS), Katy McShane (NYCEDC)

Chairman Donald Giampietro convened the meeting at 2:30PM.

Commission Procedures

Chairman Donald Giampietro announced that the aim of the first IBZ Boundary Commission meeting is to initiate the process of reviewing the proposed modifications to the existing Industrial Business Zone (IBZ) boundaries and reviewing the recommendation of establishing an additional IBZ in Staten Island. It was noted that this meeting represents the second cycle of meetings for the commission; it was first convened November 2005 for the initial creation of IBZs and associated Ombudsman area throughout the five boroughs; for which the Commission approved the proposed boundaries on April 6, 2006.

- Chair asked all attendees to sign in and to speak into microphones as a means of recording. Chair asked all attendees to introduce themselves and indicate if they are attending as a Proxy, and who they are representing.

Chair announced that when the Boundary Commission comes to the items related to a specific borough, only the respective borough representative – for that borough – can vote along with the other non-borough representatives. Borough representatives can vote only on the borough they represent.

- Chair announced a resolution to authorize the Chairperson to determine the time and date of Commission meetings, the order of business, and all matters of procedure at Commission meetings; resolution is passed unanimously with no abstentions.
- Chair introduced a resolution to appoint Miquela Craytor and Asima Jansveld as staff to the IBZ Boundary Commission and Kathleen Ahn (SBS) as counsel for the IBZ Boundary Commission; resolution is passed unanimously with no abstentions.
- Chair introduced a resolution that the Commission is to serve as lead agency for the City Environmental Quality Review (CEQR Review) for the creation of new or modification of existing Industrial Business Zones; resolution is passed unanimously with no abstentions.

Director of Industrial Initiatives Report

Ms. Miquela Craytor discussed Mayor Bloomberg’s industrial policy and the criteria for designating IBZs.

- Ms. Craytor thanked the Boundary Commission for attending the meeting, first gathering since 2006 when IBZs were created
- Ms. Craytor explained the rationale for Industrial Business Zones:
 - In early 2006 the City created 16 Industrial Business Zones across the City where expanded business services are available for industrial and manufacturing businesses.
 - This designation fosters high-performing business districts by creating competitive advantages over locating in areas outside of New York City.
 - The IBZs are supported by tax credits for relocating within them, zone-specific planning efforts, and direct business assistance from Industrial Providers of NYC Business Solutions Industrial and Transportation.
 - In view of the purposes of IBZs, to foster industrial sector growth by creating real estate certainty, the Bloomberg Administration has stated that it will not support the rezoning of these areas for residential use.
 - In 2011, the City announced suite of initiatives to strengthen the industrial sector and help small industrial businesses grow in NYC
 - One of initiatives is to create an IBZ in SI
 - In the process of creating the SI IBZ, we have taken the opportunity to also convert the existing IBZ boundaries to Mets and Bounds instead of Block and Lot as they currently exist
 - Minor adjustments to align with zoning, and remove non-conforming uses where most logical
 - Results in a gain of approximately 2674 acres of M-zone land in IBZs

- 107 acres if we exclude SI IBZ
 - Brooklyn approximately 6.5 acres
 - Bronx 13.6 acres
 - Queens 85.7 acres
 - SI 2,568 acres
- Ms. Craytor then explained the IBZ process:
 - We have informed all of the Borough Presidents offices
 - Informed and/or met with certain City Council and their staff
 - Informed and met with IBZ service providers
 - The formal process begins today with the gathering of the Boundary Commission
 - After the proposed boundary maps are submitted we will hold public meeting on July 20, 2012
 - Comments submitted by letter or through testimony on July 20, 2012
 - Boundary Staff review of relevant public comments
 - Boundary Staff proposed recommendations to Commission
 - Final discussion and vote projected to occur in September 2012
 - The Boundary Commission process is public and open to input and comment from all community stakeholders.

Assistant Director of Boundary Commission Staff Report

Ms. Asima Jansveld provided a review of the proposed boundaries and area features for Queens, NY IBZs. Ms. Jansveld noted the following points for each IBZ:

- Jamaica
 - In the central portion of the existing IBZ, there was an expansion to align the boundary with M-zoned district lines
 - There were minor zoning boundary alignments in western portion; parcels taken out of western portion are primarily residential land use
- JFK
 - Addition of small section north of current boundary to add M zoning district
 - Exclusion of residential clusters (land use) in central portion and along 147th Ave in eastern portion
 - Minor boundary alignments in central area – excluding R-zoned area
- Long Island City
 - Northwest portion: inclusion of M zoned land on river, which is the Ravenswood Generating Station
 - Central portion: including primarily industrial/manufacturing land uses along 24th St: align the existing IBZ boundary to the M1-2 zoning district along 24th Street. This area is located within the existing LIC Ombudsman Area and extends along both sides of 24th Street from 37th Avenue to the north and 40th Avenue to the south.

- Western portion: aligning boundary to MX zoning district line (portions excluded are mixed zoning M and R) – this is the same for area in southern block of IBZ along Queens-Midtown Tunnel area
- Southeastern portion: excluding R-zoned areas
- Maspeth
 - Northern portion: aligning to M zoning district, excluding R-zoned land
 - Eastern portion: creating more rational boundaries, conforming to street centerlines and excluding residential uses where possible
 - Southern portion: excluding M zoned land with residential enclave
- Steinway
 - Central area: create boundaries at consistent depth from 20th Ave
 - Southern piece along grand central: aligning to M zoning district (excluding R zoned area)

Adoption of the Resolution

Mr. Giampietro moved to adopt the Resolution to recommend for public review the proposed boundary modifications for the IBZ Boundaries in Queens, NY.

Ms. Miller moved to adopt the resolution.

Mr. Pinsky seconds the motion.

Resolution is accepted to adopt the public review.

Ms. Jansveld provided a review of the proposed boundaries and area features for Bronx, NY IBZs. Ms. Jansveld noted the following points for each IBZ:

- Bathgate:
 - Northern portion: aligning to M zoning district (excluding C-zoned areas)
 - Eastern cut-out: majority of block is non-industrial uses (residential/community facility) on E 176th St; excluded area between E 175th and E 176th is aligning to M zoning district (area excluded is mixed M and R zoned)
 - Southern cut-outs:
 - Consistent depth of 215’ from Claremont (westernmost portion)
 - 100’ depth from Washington Ave (excluding cluster of residential and commercial land uses)
 - Western additions: aligning with M1 district (including additional M zoned areas)
- Eastchester:
 - Northern portion: aligning to M zoning districts (both inclusions and exclusions); exclusion in northeast section is R-zoned
 - Western portion: aligning to M zoned district and street centerline
 - New England Thruway: excluded area is a disconnected from IBZ. Includes one motel that is for sale, three parking lots with billboards, and two story industrial building.

- Southern addition: aligning to M-zoning district
- Hunts Point
 - Parkland exclusions throughout
 - Exclusions north of Randall Ave: aligning to M zoning district (R-zoned areas are being excluded)
- Port Morris
 - Northern portion exclusions/additions: aligning boundary to consistent depth from 147th St; aligning to M1-2 boundary (Set boundary to depth of 100' from E.147th Street. Follow M1-2 District boundary at Austin Place and E. 149th Street)
 - Central exclusions: aligning to Bruckner Expressway (isolated industrial building)
 - Southern addition: adding M zoned area
 - Southwest exclusion: zoning alignments on western portion (excluding mixed M and R zoned areas)
- Zerega
 - Western additions/subtractions: primarily zoning alignments (areas excluded are R-zoned, areas included are M-zoned)
 - Southern additions/subtractions:
 - Area added is M zoned
 - Area excluded is a residential cluster land use (even though it is M zoned)

Adoption of the Resolution

Mr. Giampietro moved to adopt the Resolution to recommend for public review the proposed boundary modifications for the IBZ Boundaries in the Bronx, NY.

Mr. Ronda moved to adopt the resolution.

Mr. Pinsky seconds the motion.

Resolution is accepted to adopt the public review.

Ms. Jansveld provided a review of the proposed boundaries and area features for Brooklyn, NY IBZs. Ms. Jansveld noted the following points for each IBZ:

- Brooklyn Navy Yard
 - Western exclusion: zoning alignment – area excluded is R zoned
- East New York
 - Northern exclusion: Align boundary to M-zoned District. Remove portion majority of block occupied with community facilities (land use)
 - Eastern exclusion: Align to M-zoned district, removing portions in C-zoned district
 - Southern portion: aligning to M-zoned district. Areas excluded are R-zoned; areas included are M-zoned
- Flatlands/Fairfield
 - Eastern portion:

- C-zoned area excluded in northwestern area
 - M-zoned areas included along western, southern, and eastern sides
 - Western portion:
 - Along tracks: Align boundary to M-zoned district, removing portion in R-zoned district
 - Southern area: area included is M-zoned; large area excluded is C-zoned (smaller portion further west is R-zoned)
 - Western side – minor boundary modifications to include M-zoned areas and exclude R-zoned areas
- Greenpoint/Williamsburg
 - Northern changes: aligning to M-zoned areas
 - Southern addition: aligning to M-zoning district (area included is M1-2)
- North Brooklyn
 - Northern-most exclusion: Place boundary at depth of 100' from Manhattan Ave at Box Street, prolonging to Ash Street
 - Along McGuinness Ave: exclusion of residential land use to keep boundary at 100' depth (or less) from McGuinness; exclusion of commercial land use further south on McGuinness
 - Place boundary at centerline of Nassau Ave; Block is predominantly residential and commercial in character
 - Excluding park and commercial uses south of BQE (Place boundary along centerline of Lombardy St and Morgan Ave; block is commercial in character)
 - Boundary to follow Debevoise Ave south of BQE (Place boundary along centerline of Debevoise Ave; prolonging through to Lombardy St)
 - Other changes in southern portion: mostly related to street alignments
 - Large addition southeast of Melrose street: addition of M-zoned, industrial land uses
 - Furthest south portion:
 - Place boundary at M-zoned boundary, removing parking lot, charter school and direct mailing facility operated by Doe Foundation.
 - Align boundary with M1-1 district to Varet St; Place boundary south to Flushing Ave at depth of 100' from Bushwick Ave.
- Southwest Brooklyn
 - Red hook:
 - Northern-most addition: aligning with M-zoned district (area added is M-zoned)
 - Bowne St area addition: primarily industrial in land use; M-zoned areas added – truck route
 - Atlantic Basin addition: including Port Authority parking lot

- Exclusion between Pioneer and Sullivan: aligning to M zoning district boundary (excluding R-zoned area)
- Gowanus:
 - Most exclusions place boundary at 100' distance from 3rd Ave (inclusions rationalize where residential land uses have been excluded before) – worked to be inclusive of industrial uses
- Sunset Park:
 - Removal of Bush Terminal Park
 - Boundary rationalizes centerline of 3rd Ave

Adoption of the Resolution

Mr. Giampietro moved to adopt the Resolution to recommend for public review the proposed boundary modifications for the IBZ Boundaries in Brooklyn, NY.

Mr. Bearak moved to adopt the resolution.

Mr. Pinsky seconds the motion.

Resolution is accepted to adopt the public review.

Ms. Jansveld provided a review of the proposed boundaries and area features for Staten Island, NY IBZ. Ms. Jansveld noted that the boundaries were proposed based on public outreach during the North Shore Study and the West Shore Study.

Adoption of the Resolution

Mr. Giampietro moved to adopt the Resolution to recommend for public review the establishment of boundaries of an Industrial Business Zone within the borough of Staten Island based on the proposed boundaries presented to the Commission.

Mr. Pinsky moved to adopt the resolution.

Ms. Ward seconds the motion.

Resolution is accepted to adopt the public review.

Closing Discussion

Mr. Giampietro discussed the next steps which include:

- July 2: public comment period begins
- July 20: public hearing at 110 William Street

Mr. Giampietro encouraged everyone to attend.

Question and Answer Period

Mr. Giampietro opened the floor to questions and answers

- Mr. Bearak asked how the public would be notified.
 - Mr. Giampietro responded that the Boundary Commission staff would follow Open Meetings Law and as such would file the meeting in the City Record. The proposed boundaries would also be filed on the NYCEDC website for public review.
 - Mr. Bearak asked when the public comment period would end.

- Mr. Giampietro responded that it would likely end on July 20, 2012.
- Mr. Ronda asked what public outreach would be undertaken leading up to the Public Hearing.
 - Ms. Craytor responded that the Boundary Commission staff met with the IBZ Service Providers to discuss changes and would follow up based on the Service Provider recommendations. Ms. Jansveld noted that all Community Boards would be emailed with the public website.
- Ms. Baron asked to confirm the last date for public comment.
 - Mr. Giampietro confirmed that it would likely be July 20, 2012.
- Mr. Bearak asked how the proposed boundaries would be adjusted based on public comment.
 - Ms. Craytor responded that staff will go through comments and present these in terms of recommended modifications to the existing and proposed IBZs at the next Boundary Commission meeting. She noted that Boundary staff would review the comments, and look only at those comments that were relevant to the existing IBZs or those that were subject to the Industrial Policy Directive pursuant to Title 22, Section 625 of the New York City Administrative Code. She noted that Boundary staff would follow the precedent set in the 2006 Industrial Business Zone Boundary creation process.

Mr. Pinsky moved to adjourn the meeting at 11:30am.

Meeting adjourned.